



Course Supplement

Paper Review Guidelines for AI, Database, and Computer Graphics Courses

William H. Hsu
Kansas State University

Department of Computing and Information Sciences
Laboratory for Knowledge Discovery in Databases (KDD Lab)

Course web site: <http://www.kddresearch.org/Courses/>
Instructor home page: <http://www.cis.ksu.edu/~bhsu>



Reviews and Literature Reviews

- **Courses with Paper Reviews**
 - * **CIS 598: Undergraduate Independent Study**
 - * **CIS 690: Data Mining Systems (CIS 535)**
 - * **CIS 636: Introduction to Computer Graphics**
 - * **CIS 732: Machine Learning and Pattern Recognition**
 - * **CIS 736: Computer Graphics**
 - * **CIS 798, CIS 890: Topics in Computer Science**
 - * **CIS 830: Topics in Artificial Intelligence**
 - * **CIS 990: Graduate Seminar in Computer Science**
- **Courses with Literature Review Requirements for Reports**
 - * **CIS 530, CIS 730: Artificial Intelligence**
 - * **CIS 560: Database System Concepts**





Guidelines

- “It’s More of a Guideline” – Barbarossa, *Pirates of the Caribbean*
- Approximately one page
- 10-12 point font
- 3-6 paragraphs
- 3 sections
 - * Synopsis / Summary: < 1/3 of review
 - * Critique of Content: > 1/2 of review
 - * Critique of Presentation: the rest



Writing Good Reviews

- First: What Kind of Paper Is It?
- Content Critique
 - * Novel contribution
 - * Key strengths
 - * Key weaknesses
 - * Open questions
- Presentation Critique
 - * Accessibility
 - * Target audience?
 - * Reproducibility of experimental results
 - * Soundness
 - * Overall: was the paper convincing?

